

COMMUNITY-BASED NATURAL  
RESOURCE MANAGEMENT:  
A RE-ANALYSIS OF COMMUNITY  
RELATIONSHIPS IN FOUR DOMAINS

A SEARCA Professorial Chair Lecture  
By  
Corazon B. Lamug, Ph.D.

Organization of Paper

- Introduction
- Conceptual Framework of Community Relationships
- Method of re-analysis
- Results of re-analysis
- Conclusions

Objective of Paper

- To re-analyze community relationships in four domains from different studies on CBNRM through a sociological lens.
- Four domains of relationships
  - Relationships of community with the natural resource
  - Relationships among community members
  - Relationships of community with NGOs
  - Relationships of community with GA/LGU

CBNRM in Brief

- Designed to address the deteriorating state of natural resources
- The community is given the opportunity and responsibility to manage in a sustained way the natural resources (forest or coastal) and make decisions affecting its well-being as determined by technical, socio-cultural, economic, political and environmental factors.

Conceptual Framework: Community Relationships in Four Domains

Relationships of community with the local natural resources

- Worldviews
- Life projects

Relationships among community members

1. Community attachment
2. Formal organization
3. Empowerment

### Relationships between community and NGOs

1. Organizational development
2. Dependency-autonomy
3. Networks

### Relationships between community and GA/LGU

1. Policy and power relations
2. Incentives
3. Co-management

### Method Used

- The materials
  - Criteria for selection
  - 95 materials reviewed
    - Thesis/dissertation
    - Research report or journal publication
    - Paper presented or published in edited volume
- \* Selection neither comprehensive nor exhaustive

### • Method of Analysis

- Coding: two- step process
  - Key statements are quoted and classified
  - Codes from different materials organized by themes
- Analysis: two-step analysis
  - Analysis within domain
  - Integrated analysis for all domains

### Relationship of community with local natural resources

1. Beliefs on the interrelatedness of humans, nature and the supernatural
2. Beliefs in mastery of nature and utility of natural resources

### Interrelatedness of humans, nature and the supernatural

#### 1. Organic relationship of the components of the system

- Interconnectedness of humans, nature and the supernatural
- Rituals are symbolic expressions of the relationships between human beings and nature.

## 2. Centrality of land and natural resources

- Land is sacred and land is life.
- The harmonious relationship and rational management of the ecosystem define a people's ethnic identity and also ensure the cultural continuity of the group.

## 3. Indigenous knowledge system

- Indigenous peoples acutely aware of different components of their life field.
- Indigenous communities have intimate knowledge of their forest environment, fish species and ecology

## 4. Values and traditions

- Indigenous philosophy that nature is not to be conquered and controlled but should be respected by adapting to and harmonizing with it.
- Life sustaining value of nature and resources is the foundation for social organization and generational socialization.

## 5. Resource management systems, norms and customary practices

- Folk beliefs and practices are very powerful and effective in combating overexploitation of marine and forest resources.
- Local indigenous institutional arrangements facilitate the application of different local resource management practices.

## 6. Identity, belongingness and resilience

- A deep sense of identity and belongingness is evident among tribal groups owing to kinship ties, common cultural heritage and shared territory.
- The community has developed effective institutions for implementing collective action rules that promote forest conservation.

## Mastery of nature and utility of natural resources

### 1. Application of scientific knowledge and technology transfer

- Technical assistance to achieve sustainable management of resources
- Study tours to sites where technology has been successfully applied.

## 2. Emphasis on production and income generation

- Raise production levels to meet the needs of communities and for the market.
- Infrastructure component of CBNRM in support of market oriented production.

## 3. Assessment of CBNRM impacts

- Determine extent to which projects have achieved their intended impacts.
- Focus on social, economic and environmental impacts.

## Analysis of relation of community with local resource

- Utilitarian worldview is the rule in most CBNRM communities.
- The exploitative and instrumental character of utilitarian worldview leads to end of management systems with end of project.
- Worldviews are ideal types

- There is wide variation among indigenous people in resource management systems.
- Studies on IPs have a romanticized or idealized notion of their worldviews and life projects glossing over cultural changes in response to changing conditions.
- Practitioners of indigenous systems do not have to be indigenous peoples.
- Not all indigenous peoples practice indigenous resource management systems.

## Relationships among community members

1. Community attachment and cohesiveness
2. Formal organization
3. Empowerment

## Community attachment and cohesiveness

1. Cultural heritage and kinship system
  - Shared history, cultural ties, kinship system, and sense of community jointly cultivate cohesiveness.
  - Group identity and belongingness have shaped the character of institutions for implementing collective action rules that promote forest conservation.

## 2. Affiliational ties spurred by collective action and benefits

- Cooperative undertakings forged a strong sense of community connectedness.
- The experience of collective action in managing a project fostered camaraderie and unity among the members of the organization.

## Formal Organization

1. Purpose for organizing
  - Self initiated and externally assisted
  - IPs are generally self initiated
  - Two-thirds of organizations in CBNRM are externally initiated

## 2. Organizational form

People's organizations took different forms

- Tribal organization
- Association of upland farmers or fishers
- Cooperatives

## 3. Organizational structure and participation

- Issues on competence, ability and transparency of leaders
- Participation was studied in many forms
  - Participation of women
  - Tasks and activities participated in
  - Factors facilitating participation

## Empowerment

- Educational and capability building interventions at individual and organizational levels
- Participation in decision making in planning, implementation and evaluation of resource management projects

## Analysis of relationships among community members

- Collective action for NRM is predicated on functioning organizations with affective, structural and empowerment facets.
- Issues given little attention
  - Who are the community members?
  - Stratification of barangay members into participants and non-participants of project
  - Dynamics of elite and marginal community members

- Indigenous peoples formed foundations for establishing linkages with other organizations
- Resilience of IPs in adapting to changes in their political environment
- Decay of organizations after termination of project
- Value of using existing organizations

- Issues on empowerment process
  - Was there intrinsic value in learning by doing?
  - Satisfaction of innovating and eventually succeeding?
  - Gaining social status in the community as a consequence?
  - Transferring the empowerment gains to other aspects of community life not directly related to CBNRM.

#### Relationships between community and NGOs

1. Organizational development
2. Dependency-autonomy
3. Networks

#### Organizational development

##### 1. Community organizing

- Phases of community organizing
- Hold group formation orientation or leadership training
- Assess status of forest or coastal ecosystem

- Crucial role of community organizer
- Challenge of consolidating and strengthening the organization
- Identifying and developing strong leaders
- Adjustment of organizational structure and system with increase in organizational size and as projects increased

##### 2. Resource management activities

- Activities of POs include planning and implementation of such projects as nursery, agro-forestry, trail construction, forest protection and management.
- In CBCRM, the activities include establishment of community-managed marine reserve and fish sanctuary, patrol activities to deter illegal fishing.

### 3. Addressing tenure and security issues

- CADTs and CBFMAs
- Competition with commercial fishers
- Use of illegal fishing methods
- Formation of councils and federations, passing of municipal ordinances to address these issues.

### 4. Management of projects of the organization

- Income generating projects (enterprise development, micro-credit)
- Separate projects for women
- POs source funds from external sources to finance projects

### 5. Organizational concerns

- Concern on leadership: competence and trustworthiness; continuity of leadership
- Concern on membership composition
- Increase in size of membership

### Dependency-autonomy

#### 1. Participatory processes

- NGOs instrumental in issuance of CADTs
- Incompetence of NGOs
- POs dependent on NGOs; failed to develop self reliance

### 2. Exit of NGOs

- Project nature of CBNRM
- Status of POs at end of project
- Effectiveness of POs in resource management
- Exit strategies of NGOs

### Networks

#### 1. Federation of POs

- Strengthening coordination among POs
- Addressing common areas of concern

## 2. Linkages with private sector, sources of credit and grants

- NGOs assisted community in sourcing funds for credit and grants.
- Private sector groups were linked up with POs.
- Proposals submitted to agencies for projects.

## 3. Formation of multi-sectoral groups

- Stakeholders forged agreements on common concerns.
- Signing of covenant between POs, LGU and other organizations
- A coastal zone management council was formed for lobbying for ordinance on fishing.

## Analysis of relationships between community and NGO

- Extol important role of NGO in enabling communities to manage their natural resources
- Modal strategy is the establishment of formal organizations
- Attendant issues
  - Establishment of new organizations
  - Little attention to structural context of organization formation

- Lack of preparedness of people to form organization
- Who are the community members organized into POs?
- Failure to plan exit strategies
- Organizational decay at end of project

- Ineffective in institutionalizing the social infrastructural gains for self reliant communities
- NGOs facilitated networking
- NGO self interest may be promoted in networking

## Relationship between community and LGU/GA

1. Policy and power relations
2. Incentives
3. Co-management

## Policy and power relations

### 1. Community and DENR

- Forest policy making is still highly centralized
- Some policies are inconsistent
- Policy implementation issues
  - Capability of administrative machinery
  - Uneven distribution of power among resource managers

### 2. Community and LGU

- Ordinances and resolutions
- Support of local government executives
- Power issues

## Incentives

### 1. Land tenure and use rights

- CADTs and CBFMAs
- Municipal ordinances granting exclusive use of municipal waters to small fishers
- Declaring a bay as a special fisheries demarcated area for registered resource users.

### 2. Cash income and livelihood enterprises

- Reforestation projects
- Livelihood projects a program component
- Issues on non-transparency in financial transactions, non-equitable benefit sharing, and selective project participation.
- Reports on increase in income and level of living of project participants

### 3. Technical assistance and capability building

- Technology transfer – silviculture, horticulture, fish catching technologies
- Visit other farms or fishing areas that show use of successful technology use.
- Technical assistance is a major cost of project sites.

### 4. Support services

- Inter-institutional support
- LGU support: infrastructure; water supply system
- Legislation, funding and enforcement
- Extension, credit and marketing services

### Co-management

- Sharing of responsibility between government and community in resource management
- Formation of co-management bodies
- Deputized ENRO
- Collaborating organizations share resources and responsibilities in project implementation

### Analysis of relationships of community and GA/LGU

- GA and LGUs set policies, programs and regulations in natural resource use.
- Funds from grants and projects are accessed through agencies and units.
- Power issues

- Locate relationships in positions of partnership
- Accord respect and trust to the other as foundation
- DENR has a lot to learn in effecting partnership norms

- LGUs function depending on capabilities and leadership attributes of local executives.
- Frequent change in occupants of national and local positions poses challenges
- Community organizations have to demonstrate their capability to be deserving of partnership status.

### Conclusions

- Complexity of community relationships
- Networks, trust and social capital
- Implications of community relationships in natural resource management

### Complexity of community relationships

#### 1. Theorizing community

- Meaning of community has evolved over the years: focus on place, interest, and communion
- Boundaries demarcating community inclusion (physical, religious, linguistic)
- Qualities of tolerance, reciprocity and trust.
- What are the meanings of community in CBNRM?

## 2. Domains of community relationships

- Four domains as focus of this study
- By no means the only relationships in CBNRM
- Other domains is a topic for another paper

## 3. The contexts of community relationships

- Imperative to take into account the contextual circumstances and conditions of communities.
- Various interrelated aspects of community context
  - Historical: past experiences
  - Social structural: stratification among members

- Cultural: traditions and belief systems
- Political: embeddedness in political structures
- Economic: inputs and benefits
- Ecological: degradation of resource base

## Networks, trust and social capital

### 1. Networks – visualizations of associations that map social relations.

- Importance of ideals, beliefs, and values of actors.
- Help build a sense of self and individuality
- Social connection can widen what people can achieve.

## 2. Trust – Creates a 'bank of resources'

- A bonding element in social relationships
- Bridge between external social networks.
- Operates as 'lubricant' of social relations.
- Facilitates coordinated action
- Trust is a relatively neglected aspect of networking in CBNRM

## 3. Social capital

- It is about the value of social networks, bonding similar people and bridging between diverse people with norms of reciprocity.
- It is the goodwill available to individuals or groups.
- Its source lies in the structure and content of social relationships.

- It is the ability to safeguard benefits through participation in social networks and other social structures.
- Refers to the set of norms, networks, institutions and organizations.
- Structural and cognitive social capital
- Social capital as bonding and bridging

## Implications of community relationships in natural resource management

### 1. Community relationships by definition are people centered.

- Overlapping bases for communities: place, interest, livelihood
- Important to situate communities in historical, social, cultural and other contexts
- Utility of community relationships as framework in analyzing CBNRM experiences

- Strengthening social capital as lubricant for collective action
- Emphasis on forming and neglect of norming in organizational development.
- Little attention to community attachment, sense of belonging, and trust.
- Social networking parallels metabolic network of cells and ecosystems.
- Challenge to make our value system compatible with the demands of human dignity and ecological sustainability.

### 2. Forging equitable relationships in CBNRM

- Concern on equity is more in intention than in concrete action.
- DENR has a long way to go in effecting people oriented programs.
- Learning curve is evident
- More can be done to hasten the learning
- Benefit from similar experiences
- Forge genuine partnership with local communities

### 3. Aim to attain genuine partnership

- Currently neither party has the fundamental capability and trust to build social capital for collective action.
- Essential to strengthen social infrastructure through building social capital
- More effort could be exerted on both parties to truly equip them for genuine partnership.

### 4. Spread the modest gains in CBNRM

- Even as strategies and operations are being fine tuned
- Lessons have to be consolidated
- Best practices shared
- Innovative environment established
- POs have become agents of change
- Workshops and conferences continue to be held.
- Spread the gospel of CBNRM